

REVIEWS

Philip Grierson, Irish Bulls and Numismatics, edited by Lucia Travaini (Rome: Edizioni Quasar, 2011), 120 pp., illus.

THIS slim but pleasing volume is offered as an affectionate tribute to the memory of Philip Grierson by the Italian scholar Lucia Travaini, friend, disciple, and colleague, and joint author with him of the excellent volume in the *Medieval European Coinage* series devoted to the issues of South Italy, Sicily and Sardinia. Grierson was on any view the most eminent numismatic scholar of the second half of the twentieth century, and his legacy to our subject is such that publications such as the present one, enlightening both about his contributions to knowledge and about the factors that led to them, have a very special value.

Of the texts that Prof. Travaini has assembled, *Irish Bulls*, a youthful jeu d'esprit by Grierson (here reprinted in facsimile from a pre-Second World War printing by the Rampant Lions Press), is slight in content, but it testifies to Grierson's enduring sense of humour, and it is the only item in his very extensive published output which directly or indirectly reflects the fact that he was of Southern Irish Protestant stock. It is followed in the volume by a lengthy interview given by Grierson in 1978 to *The Caian*, his Cambridge college's annual in-house publication, which provides much essential information about his educational background, his academic career, and his diverse scholarly and personal interests. Its inclusion here will be particularly useful for scholars of the future, who may find back issues of *The Caian* singularly difficult to locate, and Prof. Travaini deserves our warmest congratulations for this.

The numismatic community will also be much indebted to Prof. Travaini both for her brief memoir of Grierson with which the volume begins and for her more thoughtful essay, later in the volume, 'Philip Grierson: History and Coins. Monetary economy, Russian beards and the origin of money', reprinted here from the Italian periodical *Rivista di Storia Economica*. In both places her expressions of opinion on Grierson's scholarly achievement and personal attitudes seem in general to be very well-founded, and her measured explanation of Grierson's early flirtation with Marxism is as fairly put as is the passage and accompanying footnote in which she acknowledges Grierson's failure in the early 1960s to recognise the abilities of Michael Metcalf.

On one issue only, but one that is of some salience for readers of this *Journal*, is the present reviewer not quite of the same mind as Prof. Travaini. As she very properly points out, Grierson's ground-breaking explanations for the content of the two celebrated hoards of seventh-century gold tremisses at Sutton Hoo and Crondall have recently attracted serious criticism in the light of the greatly increased evidence that is now available for the existence of an active monetary economy at that period, and the need for a fresh interpretation of both

hoards, along lines suggested by Dr Gareth Williams,¹ is one that she endorses in her *Rivista* article (the relevant paragraphs are on pp. 87–9 of the present volume). So far as the Crondall hoard is concerned, that causes this reviewer no undue problem, for, even if one puts on one side any doubts as to whether the whole of the hoard was recovered, Dr Williams is certainly correct to point out both that Grierson's interpretation of the hoard as an intended wergild payment of 100 shillings fails to take account of the additional presence in the hoard of two pieces of Anglo-Saxon jewellery, and that Grierson's argument also relies on a clearly over-ingenious argument by which he seeks to explain that although 101 coins were reported as being found, only 100 of them would have constituted the intended payment.

The position as regards Sutton Hoo is rather different, for, as Dr Williams himself has remarked, 'the correspondence between the number of coins (including blanks) and the number of oars [on the Sutton Hoo boat] is certainly a striking coincidence',² and Grierson's contention that the number of coins and coin blanks found is related to the number of oarsmen is one that is hard to dismiss out of hand, whether or not there is substance to his further contention that the two gold ingots contained in the same purse represented 'an unusually splendid form of Charon's obol' intended for the boat's steersman.

One final very small point to draw attention to is that in his interview for *The Caian* Grierson is reported as remarking (at the foot of p. 73 in this volume) that he once walked the whole fifty miles from London to Cambridge on a single night in November 1932 or November 1933, 'having gone to play in London'. It would seem to this reviewer likely that the correct reading should be 'having gone to a play in London', which would not be a wholly uninteresting statement, since it would be the only evidence in this volume for Grierson taking an interest in the theatre (as distinct from the cinema), just as a reference to Verdi's *Requiem* (on p. 63) is the only evidence here for his keen interest in music.

The book has a bilingual English and Italian text, so presents no difficulties for an English-speaking readership, and it is an excellent buy for its published price of 18 euros.

HUGH PAGAN

REFERENCE

Williams, G., 2006. 'The circulation and function of coinage in conversion-period England', in B. Cook and G. Williams (eds.), *Coinage and History in the North Sea World, c. AD 500–1250. Essays in Honour of Marion Archibald* (Leiden and Boston, 2006), 145–92.

¹ Williams 2006, 173–81.

² Williams 2006, 178.

The Cuerdale Hoard and Related Viking-Age Silver and Gold from Britain and Ireland in the British Museum, edited by James Graham-Campbell, BM Research Publication 185 (London: British Museum Press, 2011), xii + 387 pp., 83 plates.

THE Cuerdale hoard is justly famed as the biggest single tranche of Viking-Age silver ever found in the British Isles, and is among the largest Viking hoards *tout court*. It contained over 40 kg of silver, comprising about 1,200 objects and 7,500 coins; the latter accounted for around a quarter of the hoard's total content by weight. Presentation of a confident estimate of the hoard's make-up is one of the primary achievements of Professor Graham-Campbell and the other contributors to this volume. It constitutes the most authoritative treatment published to date of the Cuerdale hoard, for the authors have trawled not only the extensive published records, but also unpublished archival material preserved in the British Museum and elsewhere. Together they present a formidably detailed survey of the discovery and content of the hoard, and of certain elements of its wider context. This is no mean feat. Found on land owned by Richard Assheton in the Duchy of Lancaster on 15 May 1840, the hoard has, because of its size, historical importance and find-spot, been well recorded since virtually the day of its discovery;¹ the contrast with so many early-nineteenth-century hoards, dispersed leaving little trace, is striking. Most of the find was sent to the British Museum, where it was examined and published in (for the time) exemplary fashion by Edward Hawkins,² though some of the coins and metalwork were retained by Assheton, and other small parcels became detached at an early stage. More problematically, the Duchy of Lancaster chose to distribute the bulk of the find among interested public institutions and private individuals across Europe. Lists of recipients were kept (and are reproduced as an appendix in this volume), but nonetheless pursuing the fate of Cuerdale material remains deeply complex. For this reason it is extremely gratifying that most of the relevant primary material as well as interpretation of it has now been published in one place: quotations, images, lists and other details are offered up in impressive bulk. The information gathered in this volume permits more confident reconstruction of the find than ever before, and it will form an essential basis for any future work on Cuerdale and its context.

As befits the largely non-numismatic content of the hoard, it is on metalwork that the spotlight shines most brightly. The volume is fundamentally a catalogue of Viking-Age metalwork in the British Museum, the majority of which derives from Cuerdale. Catalogues and plates of metalwork occupy half the volume, and five of the nine chapters of discussion deal with various aspects and categories of the objects. This material is intended to complement David Wilson's classic catalogue of late Anglo-Saxon metalwork in the British Museum, which did not include objects classed as part of the Viking or Irish tradition even when found or quite

probably made in the British Isles.³ It is with these that the present volume is primarily concerned. It covers everything from rough ingots of various forms through to brooches and rings of great accomplishment and beauty. Inevitably there is uncertainty in the classification of certain pieces, and one hopes at some stage for a wide-ranging treatment of the metalwork of the ninth to eleventh centuries, comparing developments across northern Europe. Yet there is a great deal to chew over in the meantime. The authors discuss in depth matters of attribution, use, economic context and manufacture, as well as secondary treatment. It should also be stressed that although Cuerdale is by far the biggest single source of the British Museum's relevant holdings, fifteen other hoards and many single-finds are represented as well. These offer a broad range of dates and geographical origins, and include gold as well as silver. Even if the focus necessarily remains on Cuerdale, these other finds (and references to still more outside the British Museum) serve to flesh out the broader setting. What one finds is not just a study of one – albeit very large – hoard, but a survey of metalworking practice between the ninth and eleventh centuries.

The relevance of this volume for numismatists is not to be underestimated because of its emphasis on metalwork. Coins and other objects circulated side by side in the Danelaw and other parts of the British Isles: in the context of a 'dual' or 'bullion economy' such as this, there was little meaningful separation between different categories of silver. There is also a long and detailed chapter by Gareth Williams and Marion Archibald dealing with the coins from Cuerdale (pp. 39–71). The quantity of coins involved precludes inclusion of a detailed catalogue. Instead, one of the appendices is dedicated to a summary listing of the British Museum's Cuerdale holdings, while in the main text of the numismatic chapter Williams devotes much of his effort to establishing the precise contents and date of the hoard, which leads him into a section of up-to-date commentary on each of its major segments (Anglo-Saxon, Anglo-Viking, Carolingian, Islamic and others). After careful consideration, he concludes that the hoard is most likely to have been concealed in the period c.905–10, and wisely declines from pinning it down to any specific year. He notes that the diverse makeup of the numismatic portion of the hoard suggests that it was drawn together from several distinct parcels, assembled in most cases just a little before the hoard was concealed. Williams's discussion also extends to the hoard's place within the complex monetary economy of northern England in the early tenth century. His important and well-informed treatment of all aspects of Cuerdale and its background (including several recent hoards) is sure to become a major prop of future scholarship on the subject.

In a long sub-section of the same chapter Marion Archibald returns to a subject she has considered several times in the past: that of pecking, nicking, bending and other forms of secondary treatment among the Cuerdale coins. Her work here is particularly detailed, and results in a number of significant conclusions. Archibald demonstrates that among recent coin-issues, Viking pennies generally show more evidence of peck-

¹ The first published notice appeared in *The Preston Pilot* on 16 May 1840, the day after the hoard was discovered.

² Hawkins 1843 and 1847.

³ Wilson 1964.

ing than their Anglo-Saxon counterparts; indeed, within English territory pecking and bending were not generally practiced. She also addresses the complexities of how secondary treatment came about: points which develop from this include that not every coin would be pecked in every transaction; that the number of pecks on a coin or (as discussed elsewhere in the volume by Graham-Campbell) object is not necessarily commensurate with the number of times it changed hands; and that coins were more likely to have been pecked if they were old or unfamiliar. Checking a coin's purity was thus probably as much a social and symbolic exercise as an economically motivated verification. That said, there had to be something worth testing, and coins of better silver tended to attract more test-marks in general. The often badly debased *Lunettes* pennies minted before c.875 were therefore not usually tested, and the custom of checking metallic quality seems first to have taken hold among Viking users of the higher-quality *Cross-and-Lozenge* issue (c.875–80). The earliest hoards to show extensive pecking and bending come from the last decade or so of the ninth century (though closely datable Viking finds from the period immediately before this are scarce). In other words, pecking, bending and similar practices had more than a decade of widespread use behind them in Viking territory at the time the Cuerdale hoard was put together.

This book is crucial for any student or scholar with a serious interest in Viking-Age coinage, metalwork or trade in general. It assembles important research materials and contains cutting-edge research, as well as an invaluable catalogue of precious metal objects. The British Museum Press has served its authors well in producing a volume of high quality, with illustrations (some in colour) impressive in their quality as well as quantity. Numismatics as such may only be covered by a portion of the material in this book, but as a demonstration of how specialists in allied disciplines can collaborate to shed light on all aspects of a famous hoard and related categories of archaeological material, this publication excels.

RORY NAISMITH

REFERENCES

- Hawkins, E., 1843. 'An account of coins and treasure found in Cuerdale', *NC* 5, 1–48 and 53–104.
 Hawkins, E., 1847. 'An account of coins and treasure found in Cuerdale', *Archaeological Journal* 4, 111–30 and 189–99.
 Wilson, D.M., 1964. *Catalogue of Antiquities of the Later Saxon Period, vol. I: Anglo-Saxon Ornamental Metalwork 700–1100* (London).

Mints and Money in Medieval England, by Martin Allen (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012), xvii + 576 pp., illus; *Money in the Medieval English Economy: 973–1489*, by J.L. Bolton (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2012), xv + 317 pp.

THESE TWO recently published works on the coinage of England, and its role in society and economy during the

period from Edgar's reform to the Tudors, are complementary in that while Allen provides comprehensive information on the coinage, Bolton demonstrates why that information is historically important. Accordingly, they are here reviewed together.

Allen's work will be universally welcomed by both numismatists and historians. It is a mine of detailed information, rationally organized to set out the wood as well as the trees of English monetary history in this period. While Challis' *New History of the Royal Mint* covered the whole story from earliest times to the present day, Allen's dates run from 973 to 1544, allowing him to provide more detailed coverage, and to move beyond mint history to include the study of the currency. Readers of this *Journal* will be familiar with many of the topics which have interested Allen – the hoards, the mint production figures, the size of the currency, the ecclesiastical mints, the exchanges – but he brings new information and analysis taking this work beyond his earlier articles. Bringing this all together, and updating it, makes this book the essential handbook of English medieval numismatics and monetary history. The bibliography alone will make this a constant point of reference. Readers should note, however, that this is not a book about the classification and enumeration of coin types, for which we should turn instead to Lord Stewartby's masterly treatment, *English Coins 1180–1551* (London: Spink, 2009). Nor does Allen treat with the rich single finds material, where his own Fitzwilliam Museum, and the Portable Antiquities Scheme have made such an enormous contribution. In one sense, perhaps Allen feels that this evidence which grows daily is better served by websites which can be regularly updated, but the broad outlines of the picture revealed by the single finds is already emerging quite clearly, and his reflections on this data would have been well worth reading. Nevertheless, this book represents a huge achievement, presenting the state of the subject with painstaking accuracy and sound judgement. No one will now be able to write about medieval English coins and currency without first asking, 'What does Allen say?' It is a magnificent achievement.

Allen provides the key data which historians will need if they seek to understand the English currency, but he does not set out to explain to historians why they need to tackle this subject. That is why Bolton's book is so important. As an established historian and university teacher he is well placed to introduce the study of coins and currency to other academic historians and their students. In recent decades medieval economic historians have been increasingly conscious of the highly commercial nature of late medieval society, and this awareness necessarily brings with it a growing interest in medieval money. However, post-Conquest historians have long been reluctant to engage with coins, perhaps because they enjoy such rich manuscript sources that they hesitate to engage with an additional area of study. Now Bolton's work sets out very clearly the importance of the coinage for the study of medieval England, building it into his picture of an increasingly urbanized, and commercialized society with all the necessary legal and fiscal institutions which allow him to describe the England of the period 1158 to 1351 as fully

monetized. Some may argue that this is to understate the role of money in the eleventh century, when huge sums were raised in taxation and Domesday Book records much more widely spread money rents than is sometimes realised. To my mind the ‘resounding No’ which Bolton gives to the question ‘Did a money economy exist in Anglo-Saxon and Anglo-Norman England?’ is a little too clear cut, since the line of development does not look to be simply chronological, but rather is characterized by bouts of significant monetary progress interspersed by set-backs and played out against a background of general scarcity. Nevertheless, Bolton’s picture of an increasing use of coin, made possible by new silver mines and rising mint production sketches out a very plausible line of monetary development from Edgar’s reform to the Black Death. He pays numismatics the enormous compliment of engaging fully with the evidence of the coins, hoards, recoinages and mint output figures. Sadly few historians have taken the trouble to do this, but this work will oblige others to follow his example. Bolton puts the question of medieval money right at the heart of the study of the medieval economy.

This is not to suggest that all the questions in the debate are now resolved. Bolton, like Allen, might have made greater use of the Portable Antiquities Scheme database of medieval single finds. His engagement with the Quantity Theory of Money does not really move beyond challenging a direct and proportional relationship between money and prices, though modern Quantity Theory is a good deal more sophisticated than that. Perhaps most contentiously, his understanding of the role of credit in the economy – where his outstanding work on the Borromei makes him an authority – does not really get to grips with the work of Nightingale – another authority on medieval credit. The key question here concerns how far the development of credit in the later middle ages could have liberated the economy from the effects of limited supplies of bullion. (Nightingale makes her case very effectively elsewhere in this volume.)

Yet together these two books move our subject on, and will undoubtedly provide a stimulus for further work. Historians will be unable to read Bolton without concluding that an understanding of the coinage is fundamental to the study of medieval economy, while Allen’s book will provide them with the means to develop that understanding. The information presented by Allen sets out the current state of our knowledge with great clarity and precision. Only when he moves beyond the factual to estimate the size of the currency will there be any room for debate, though even in these contentious waters he operates with sound judgement and sureness of touch. Some of Bolton’s conclusions will excite debate, but readers of the *BNJ* will derive much satisfaction from seeing money take its place in the historical mainstream.

N.J. MAYHEW

The Ipswich Mint c.973–c.1210. Volume II. Cnut the Great to the end of Edward the Confessor 1016–1066, by J.C. Sadler (Ipswich: the author, 2012), 232 pp., illus.

THIS second volume in Mr Sadler’s intended series of three volumes on the Ipswich mint is in the same format as his first volume, published in 2010, and provides the reader with excellent photo illustrations of some 450 coins struck by Ipswich moneyers under the later Anglo-Saxon kings. Of these, 199 are of Cnut, 37 are of Harold I, 9 are of Harthacnut, 191 are of Edward the Confessor, and the balance are coins of Æthelred II of which Sadler has secured illustrations since the publication of the first volume. This is on any view a substantial body of material, and an added bonus is that because each coin is illustrated it is readily possible to check the accuracy of the readings given of its inscriptions and the correctness of the die-identifications made.

The comprehensiveness of the volume, always a key factor in publications of this nature, is also very praiseworthy. The writer of this review has over recent years been collecting data about coins of the first four types of Edward the Confessor, and is pleased to be able to report that Sadler has recorded the same number of coins that he has for the *PACX* and *Radiate/Small Cross* types, and more coins than he has for the *Trefoil Quadrilateral* and *Small Flan* types. For the latter two types the difference between our two figures is down to the fact that as a specialist in the coins of the Ipswich mint Sadler has become aware of coins in dealers’ stock or coins in the possession of private collectors that would not normally have come to scholars’ attention, and the volume as a whole benefits greatly from this kind of knowledge.

In this context, it is again a pleasure to see the care which Sadler has taken to record coins of the Ipswich mint from the huge hoard, predominantly of coins of Cnut, found in the ‘Cambridge area’ in the mid 1990s but not declared to the authorities at the time of its discovery. He tabulates its Ipswich content, so far as that is known to him, on p. 77, and his example in doing so is one that should be followed by researchers into the issues of other mints operating during the reigns of Æthelred II and Cnut. It is indeed lamentable that the fact that the hoard did not go through the treasure trove procedure has as yet deterred any museum-based numismatist from recording in print what can be discovered about the component elements of so important a hoard, and those who remember the late Prof. Michael Dolley will readily be able to visualise the enthusiasm with which he would have undertaken what to him would have been the deeply congenial task of putting in the public domain everything that could be sensibly said about the hoard and its discovery.

As Rory Naismith has observed in his review of Sadler’s previous volume for this *Journal*, there are various respects in which Sadler’s treatment of his subject is not as organized as it might have been, and the book would doubtless have benefited throughout from some element of external editorial involvement. Nonetheless Sadler’s obvious enthusiasm both for the issues of the Ipswich mint and for the borough of Ipswich itself shines out of every page, and all of us should look forward to the next volume in his Ipswich series.

HUGH PAGAN

Angels and Ducats: Shakespeare's Money and Medals, by Barrie Cook (London: British Museum Press, 2012), 96 pp., illus.

SCHOLARS of English literature know very well that Shakespeare has a broad appeal, and are accustomed to the various forms of Shakespearean merchandise (ranging from tea-towels to books of middling seriousness) which fill museum gift-shops. Numismatists find no such general market among the museum-going public for paraphernalia of an equivalent kind, excluding the reproduction coins that continue to be popular items with children. The British Museum last year had the idea to show off some of their numismatic collections by yoking the idea of coinage with the name of Shakespeare, bound to appeal more widely. Now that the exhibition is over, the project has continued life in Barrie Cook's accompanying book – a book of middling seriousness. Nothing is further from my mind than the derogation of a book that brings considerable expertise to bear upon the noble task of capturing the interest of those who are neither specialists nor amateurs. It may well succeed in that design. But I am conscious for whom I am writing, and it is necessary to state, in fairness, that this is not a book that readers of the *BNJ* need seek out for their own perusal, and neither will it be of particular use to students of literature. For both constituencies there are a large number of articles and some monographs on the subject which are better laid out for the more experienced reader; Dr Cook has synthesized much of this research for a new audience. So this is a report on a missionary endeavour by an esteemed authority, and should be taken in that spirit.

The book means to show, not only what money looked like in Shakespeare's time, but how Shakespeare's treatment of monetary and numismatic themes contributed to the exploration of 'fundamental questions of authenticity and identity, legacy and morality'. A large number of quotations help him to demonstrate these themes and 'questions', though he typically uses only one or two passages to flesh out a point before moving on. This is as it should be; general reader and specialist alike would tire of exhaustive exemplification. As the author himself says, the book 'could easily be bigger; but, as a curator of coins, my professional career rests on the assumption that small things can still have an interest'.

As for the more basic problems of definition, there are interesting fragments of explanation; the reader discovers what a 'mill-sixpence' was, or an 'Edward shovel-board', and many of the English and foreign denominations commonly found in Shakespeare are described in more or less detail. Needless to say, readers of Shakespeare will find all of this information in the footnotes of the good modern annotated editions, so its purpose here is to be interesting rather than strictly useful. Nevertheless, the general reader of this book would surely have profited from a systematic enumeration and illustration of the English coins current in Shakespeare's day, and this is unfortunately missing.

One of the best sections is devoted to 'the costs of theatre', and conveniently summarizes a wealth of material which might otherwise take an effort to find. 'Money was needed everywhere in a theatre visit', as we

discover when the author leads us into and around the theatre, quoting the approximate prices of all the goods and services on offer. A table gives estimates of the 'cost of items in Shakespeare's time' – a pretty rough guide, but the sort of thing the reader will want to know; and we find out that 'a theatre visit cost no more than a snack and a magazine'.

Chapters 3 ('English names and distant places') and 4 ('Setting the foreign scene') discuss Shakespeare's use of English coin-names in plays set abroad and in the ancient world, and his references to foreign coins. These chapters are quite intriguing, as far as they go. How is it, for instance, that the 'doit', a Dutch coin, 'became the standard term he used for low-value coins in the ancient world', as Cook informs us? More scrutiny would be needed to find out. In these chapters, moreover, there are a few instances of interpretative insight. Remarkably the reference to 'guilders' among the merchants in *The Comedy of Errors*, Cook observes that 'For a flicker of a moment, we are in the Amsterdam headquarters of the Dutch East India Company, not ancient Anatolia'. Or again, of the mention of the Portuguese 'crusado' coin in *Othello*, he notes: 'Since the relations of Europe and Africa provide crucial underpinning to *Othello*, it is tempting to see the African connection lying behind this unexpected coin. Yet, there is another dimension to the play, the war against the Turks' – and so the etymological sense of *crusado* becomes significant.

Generally, though, the literary-critical elements of the book are rather blunt: interesting quotations are left without sufficient comment; not enough is done with the material. But as the examples above demonstrate, there are moments of suggestiveness. Some members of academic 'English' departments might have something to say about the confident assertion that '*Timon* is a partnership play, the work of Shakespeare and Thomas Middleton', authorship attributions between scenes coinciding with differing understandings of the worth of a 'talent' (Shakespeare, of course, being more correct); this is wobbly ground; but members of English departments are not the intended readership.

Angels and Ducats is a slim, glossy book full of attractive colour images. It looks like the companion book to an exhibition. It is not a catalogue, though; and those of us more familiar with the terrain might regret that more images of the display pieces were not included. One might also wish that coins had been reproduced in full scale. In any case, the book is led by argument, and the objects to which the text refers, including those illustrated, seem secondary to the author's drift, rather than its stimulus. If it is to be a book proper and not a catalogue, then this is the desired effect, and has been reasonably well achieved. Only on a couple of occasions does a sharp deviation towards a particular item seem forced – as when we turn for no apparent reason to Michael Mercator's medal for Drake's circumnavigation, and are sustained by references to various Shakespearean images of the world (none relating to medals, of course). The interest of the illustration makes up for it, but it does leave a taste of randomness in the discourse. In fact the whole first chapter, devoted to medals, is a little stilted, since it relies upon only a single reference (in *The Winter's*

Tale); but the contextualising information and (again) the gorgeous images carry it off.

Elsewhere one does have the sense that objects are leading the argument, but the transition is easier and the combination of illustration and Shakespearean quotation makes its own interest (as when we turn to consider the role of counters and jettons). In many parts, where we are not being given *information* but rather demonstration or interpretation, a simpler juxtaposition of quotation and image might have been more effective – which is as much as to say that the concept probably works better as an exhibition than as a book.

Qualities of the text aside, part of the difficulty with this book (and others of its kind) is in the distraction away from the reading experience caused by elements of design and format. In trying to make it look as attractive as possible – colourful, bursting with graphics and various typefaces, with wide margins and little text on the page – the design team have made it a hard book to read. This notwithstanding Dr Cook's readable, theme-driven text. I expect it is destined to be read piecemeal, with images and quotations (Shakespeare's lines are printed in big bold type) directing the eye. But I hope some readers will make their ways from cover to cover.

ALEX WONG

Northamptonshire & the Soke of Peterborough Tokens & Checks, by P.D.S. Waddell (Llanfyllin: Galata, 2012), 77 pp., illus.

SOME readers have taken the 'tokens & checks' in the title of this book for a subtitle, but those words are an essential part of a long title of a work which covers tokens from the seventeenth to twentieth century. Until 1889 the Soke of Peterborough was a part of Northamptonshire, so it is reasonably included with the rest of that county. A nice 1749 map of the area provides an appropriate frontispiece. Galata's illustrations are superb, but it is disappointing that they have produced a book which will not lie open on one's desk.

The chapter on seventeenth-century tokens seems comprehensive, except that the author omits William Risby in Corby 1658 as in need of further research (p. 9), but see now Norweb viii.9472.¹ The chapter is well illustrated but has some weaknesses: for example, Bristol was an authorized issuer of tokens twenty years earlier than c.1597, David Ramage was not a Royal Mint employee, and instead of relying on secondary authorities for Oxford the author could have quoted the £43 17s. received in tokens between Michaelmas 1651 and Michaelmas 1652.² The Barton Thorpe find (p. 7) is indeed of interest for containing both regal coins and tokens.

As regards devices on the seventeenth-century tokens, John Granger of Ashley's three 'awls' are clearly trees,

presumably ash trees. The author agrees that Edward Cooper of Northampton's device is not a rose but an artichoke. George Ecton's long-legged White Hind is lovely to behold. The alleged 'griffin' of the Feoffees of Oundle (pp. 6, 14), which would be a hybrid of an eagle and a lion, must instead be a dragon. It is difficult to understand the large 'tassels' on no. 157, since there are none in the Drapers' arms.

The book must have been completed too early for Chapter 2 to cite Dr Dykes's account of the only eighteenth-century token for the county, but both agree that the name 'George Jobson, banker' is false.³ In Chapter 3 on Unofficial Farthings, the suspicious rarity of the token of T. Harrison, Northampton (pp. 24–5) need not be described as still in doubt, for it was explained as Batty's misreading of T. HAMSON by Roy Hawkins,⁴ whose family connection with WAUKERZ BOOT FACTORY should make his description of crossed trumpets/Solomon's seal on its ticket more reliable than the author's (p. 29).

Chapter 4 on Refreshment Checks is thoughtful and well-researched. On p. 42 'WMC' might have been explained as Working Men's Club, as later in the volume. On p. 43 there are references to footnotes 11–13 which this reviewer cannot find. Chapter 5, in no fewer than twenty pages, publishes co-operative society and store checks in colour, which actually makes them look attractive; from Long Buckby two surviving dies are illustrated. Chapter 6 usefully presents Machine Tokens, including those made for Monarch Automatic Company, Northampton; those bearing F C in triangle, 'said to be a French manufacturer's mark', are attributable to Cartaux of Paris.⁵ Chapter 7 covers other items with monetary values.

So, a wide-ranging and well-illustrated survey of one Midland county's paranumismatica, which sets an example for other areas.

R.H. THOMPSON

REFERENCES

- Dykes, D.W., 2011. 'George Jobson's halfpenny', *BNJ* 81 (2011), 253–9.
- Hawkins, R.N.P., 1989. *A Dictionary of Makers of British metallic Tickets...* (London).
- Hobson, M.G. and Salter, H.E., 1933. *Oxford Council Acts 1626–1665* (Oxford).
- Sealy, D.L.F., *et al.*, 1971–73. 'Preliminary catalogue of British amusement, gaming & vending machine tokens', *Token Corresponding Society Bulletin* 1 (1971–3).
- Thompson, R.H., 1994. 'Oxford City tokens and the problem of output', *BNJ* 64, 99–113.
- Thompson, R.H. and Dickinson, M.J. (eds), 2011. *Sylloge of Coins of the British Isles 62. The Norweb Collection ... Tokens of the British Isles 1575–1750. Part VIII Middlesex and Uncertain Pieces* (London).

¹ Thompson and Dickinson 2011, no. 9472.

² Hobson and Salter 1933, 435–6; cf. Thompson 1994.

³ Dykes 2011.

⁴ Hawkins 1989, 445, 913.

⁵ Sealy *et al.* 1971–73, 180.

The Tokens, Checks, Metallic Tickets, Passes and Tallies of Wales. Volume 2. Two Hundred Years of Numismatic History, by Noel and Alan Cox (Cardiff: the authors, 2012), 177 pp., illus.

BOTH parts of the title are slightly inaccurate, but no matter – if it is Welsh, circular, metallic and has an inscription or legend on it, whether scratched or stamped, incuse or raised, the authors have done their best to include it if it was not recorded in their first volume. This second volume records 800 tokens, checks and passes discovered since the publication of their first work in 1994. Since that time the authors have diligently pursued any object that qualified for inclusion, and there can be scarcely a museum, public or private, library or archive of relevant literature in Wales that has escaped their attention. They have also visited many private collections and the number of those acknowledged is over thirty.

The authors are regular attendees at the annual Token Congress and it was at such a congress that they first revealed their research into the token of J.W. Ingram, grocer and tea dealer of Abergavenny, details of whom had eluded other researchers because Ingram does not appear in any directories. This led some people into speculating that the issuer of this token didn't exist and the tokens were therefore advertising samples made by J.W. Ingram, the Birmingham engraver of that name. The Cox twins, however, are intrepid researchers and visit all parts of Wales. They not only unearthed a printed invoice for the business, signed by Ingram's wife, but details of his birth and marriage, the birth of his children and his subsequent removal to Swansea, thus showing that old dogs can learn new tricks.

The book follows the pattern and style of the first volume, which was divided into three parts:

1. Tokens, checks, metallic tickets, passes and tallies.
2. Club and Institute checks.
3. Co-operative Society, dividend, payment and mutuality checks.

In the new volume, as in the old, each section is preceded (!) by an index and followed by a catalogue listing. The divisions are for convenience, as the first part is itself fifteen separate sections.

Each catalogue entry, although brief, contains most of what one needs to know: a description of obverse and reverse, followed by the necessary facts about size, shape, metal, thickness and edge. Each entry is followed by facts about the issuer extracted from directories, advertisements, or newspapers, etc. In some instances further details have been elicited by talking to people who used the more modern pieces listed.

Why are both parts of the title slightly inaccurate? The observant reader may notice that there is a commemorative medal for Victoria's 1897 jubilee included in the advertising tickets section, and the time frame of the book is now over a decade more than two centuries, but both are plusses, and anyway, the medal concerned might be regarded as a token of commemoration. It is an interesting medal, as the reverse inscription includes the word 'shellibiers', a word that is not in my copy of the OED. Otherwise, apart from a book referred to in the text (p. 59, *The First Dictionary of Paramismatica*)

that is not included in the bibliography, the text is remarkably error free and would satisfy the mind and habits of a picky accountant.

The work, however, has three drawbacks. The first is the lack of a single, all-embracing *index rerum*, though those who use the work regularly could, I suppose, get used to having to refer to the three separate indexes in the body of the book; most things are in there, they just take a little finding. It could also do with more illustrations, but there are often problems when the object that needs illustrating is in a locked display case in a dark corner and in any case, the entries are usually more informative (and accurate) than those in Davis and Waters, for example. The third drawback is that the book still adheres to listing the tokens by county, when even Williamson had abandoned listing seventeenth-century tokens by county in 1891, preferring to organize them by town names in alphabetical order. It is even a moot point as to whether Monmouthshire is in Wales. Some former Welsh counties exist in name only.

Do not imagine that because this is Volume Two the contents are minor and secondary to those of Volume One. There are some stunning, rare and interesting pieces included. However, given that there are 800 new pieces, some of them are what the average dealer and collectors from other disciplines would regard as junk, but there is no denying that even these are of historical interest in spite of having no commercial value, and that in the case of the more modern pieces they might otherwise easily escape detection and thus be lost to posterity, leaving future collectors to wonder what they are, when they were issued and why they were used. A good example of this are the pieces issued by the North Wales Hospital in Denbigh, plain rectangular brass pieces stamped MH, which we are informed stands for Mental Hospital and that these pieces were used c.1960–70 by patients at that hospital.

Exactly what is included? The book follows the pattern of the first volume, listing: advertising tickets, including those known as 'unofficial farthings'; barbers' checks (although no new checks have been recorded for this volume); bonus and dividend checks (including tea bonus checks); brewery checks; church, choir and temperance hall tokens and passes; colliery, mine and coking tickets; market traders' checks; military checks; miscellaneous tokens and checks; refreshment checks; telephone checks; tool and pay checks; trade union registration tallies; transport tokens and passes; and last, but by no means least, truck tickets.

The authors are to be congratulated on compiling not only this, but the previous work too, a few copies of which, I understand, are still available. Both should be in all numismatic libraries.

PAUL WITHERS

The Holy Dollars and Dumps of Prince Edward Island, by Christopher Faulkner (London: Spink, 2012), 382 pp. illus.

THIS is an excellent book that will be of great interest to students of early Canadian numismatics, counter-marked coins in general and social economic history.

Part I comprises an in-depth historical study of Prince Edward Island discussing the Island's currency situation and the local political intrigues leading up to the issue of the emergency coins that are the subject of this book, a bold action taken by the newly appointed Lieutenant Governor Charles Douglass Smith in September 1813. The quantity of dollars authorized for this issue, the people who did the work of punching the dump out of the dollar and how this operation was carried out all receive a comprehensive examination. Students of the series have long pondered the question of how to determine the official coins, issued by the Treasury, from the numerous contemporary counterfeits. The author explains in great detail why it is actually not possible with the knowledge at hand to make a definite determination in this matter. Coverage of the Island Merchants, undoubtedly the source for the majority of the contemporary counterfeits, along with survival rates for the dollars and dumps; the purchasing power of the Holey Dollar and Dump and the question of why the contemporary counterfeits circulated are made clear in great detail. There is discussion of other cut money on Prince Edward Island and the fascinating subject of 'movement and usage' of pierced dollars between Prince Edward Island and the West Indian colonies. Part I is rounded off with a section on modern forgeries and concoctions of varying descriptions produced and introduced into the numismatic market. An extensive bibliography of material from archival sources, newspapers, books, articles and auction catalogues finishes off this section.

Part II deals with the actual specimens in this rather rare series. There are only seventy-nine known examples of the Holey Dollar and twelve of the Dumps. Each of these coins has been given a name, which is very helpful in noting and following provenance details. Tables are provided listing the coins by name; date (for the dollars); host coin details; metrology of the dollars and dumps (weights, apertures or diameters, thicknesses and piercings); auction and fixed price sale references; earliest known appearances of the specific specimens; published illustrations and finally an inventory of all the known Holey Dollars and Dumps, divided into twelve groups. Each of these groups is discussed and full diagnostic details are carefully examined and accompanied by excellent enlarged photographs of the coins and blow-up images of the countermarks. The two final groups list miscellaneous and random counterstamps.

The four Appendices include Official Documents; Private Accounts; Recent Opinions and a Listing of Merchants, Artisans, Shopkeepers and Officeholders. There are four Indexes: Proper names in the Introduction; Dollars by Name; Dumps by name and Dollars by Date, followed by a List of Tables and a List of Figures used to illustrate the book.

This long needed book is the fruit of many years of historical research; correspondence with collectors and students and a painstaking first-hand analysis of nearly all the known specimens of this fascinating series. The importance of the Holey Dollar and Dump in Canadian numismatics cannot be overstated, and furthermore these coins fit into the era where similar economic circumstances required cut and countermarked local coinage adaptations in the West Indian colonies, Australia, parts of the United States and even West Africa. The

author has demonstrated how these 'adapted pierced dollars' moved between regions where similar coin mutilation action took place, which of course can be linked to shipping and trade routes. As is the case with all cut and countermarked coinages the original official action was implemented to solve a local problem. At a time when the denomination of a coin was linked to the intrinsic value of the metal it was difficult in many colonial environments to maintain the supply of coins for day-to-day transactions. The result was that credit and barter were required for even simple transactions; a system which was often cumbersome. Governor Smith's initiative to fabricate two coins from one, both with an enhanced value over the intrinsic value, was to act as an incentive to retain these coins in the local economy. While the logic for this type of official action was basically sound, typically the quantity of coins authorized was insufficient to meet the local needs properly. Thus the existence of contemporary counterfeits suggests recognition by individuals, operating unofficially, of the need to supplement the supply by introducing additional coins into the economy simply to make the marketplace work. Of course, as in the West Indies, personal profit was also certainly a motive for this action. Exposure of modern fakes is also highlighted and this is always useful to students of the series.

This is a valuable addition to a library, and it is certain that this book will be of great interest to collectors and students interested in any series of cut and countermarked coinage or the economic and currency considerations that had to be faced in many colonial areas, when access to proper coinage from the mother countries was limited or restricted.

K.V. ECKARDT

The Private Sketchbook of George T. Morgan: America's Silver Dollar Artist, by Karen M. Lee (Atlanta: Whitman Publishing, LLC, 2012), vi + 186 pp.

THE contributions made by British artists to American numismatic history have been generally overlooked. This is somewhat difficult to explain – especially given the fact that the coins designed by a couple of them are actually listed in numismatic publications under the names of the designers. Thus, we have dimes, quarters, and half dollars bearing nearly identical imagery, dubbed *Barber* dimes, etc. after their creator, Charles E. Barber. And we have one of the most famous, iconic American issues of all, the Morgan dollar, whose name pays tribute to the man who created it, another transplanted Briton, George T. Morgan.

But what do we know about these individuals, other than the coins whose designs they bear? Disappointingly little: all the average American numismatist knows about the Barbers is that there were actually two of them, William and Charles, father and son, and that they dominated what passed for artistry at the United States Mint for nearly half a century, from 1869 to 1917, during which time they produced surprisingly little work of lasting merit. And what about George T. Morgan? During the years when he *wasn't* designing his eponymous coin, what was he up to? Is there any way

we can get a better grasp of who he was, how he lived, and what he did?

We can: through the medium of a new book, *The Private Sketchbook of George T. Morgan*, Karen Lee has fleshed out the man and his story, rendering the most definitive portrait we are ever likely to have of Morgan and his career. But there is more: this book sheds valuable new light on the process of artistic creation and what it meant to be an artist in late nineteenth-century Britain and America.

The *Sketchbook's* journey into print is an interesting one. George T. Morgan acquired the blank-page, garden-variety artist's book from a Birmingham stationer a few years prior to coming to the United States. He used it carefully and sparingly over a period of nearly twenty years, filling its pages with all manner of drawings – including those of medals and coins that he wished to produce, either in the Old World or the New. The book eventually came into the possession of Stack's, then the pre-eminent American coin dealer. Stack's donated it to the Smithsonian in 1966. Securely housed in the museum's numismatic cabinet, it gathered dust for the next forty years, until it was unearthed by a prominent researcher named Jeff Garrett. Aware of the importance of what he'd discovered, Garrett advised museum staff of the event, and Curator Karen M. Lee wondered whether it might be possible to turn Morgan's *Sketchbook* into a numismatic publication. She made the attempt, and the result is this book, nothing short of a revelatory volume in American numismatics.

While Morgan's sketches form the heart of this work, numismatists will be grateful for several other, crucial elements that Lee chose to include. There is a preliminary chapter on Morgan's life and career ('A Life of Art and Labor'), that tells the artist's story more fully, and certainly better, than it has ever previously been told. The portrait of a genial, hardworking, gregarious family man emerges, one whose outlook and easygoing nature contrasted sharply with the petty jealousies that seem to have occupied the minds and careers of his two successive superiors, Chief Engravers William and Charles Barber. William disappeared from the scene in 1879, but Charles was appointed in his place, rendering Morgan's life and work difficult for the next four decades. Given the circumstances under which he worked, one wonders how Morgan was able to produce his famous silver dollar – or much else, for that matter. But produce he did, and successful work under pressure can sometimes be a mark of genius.

The second introductory chapter, called 'Sketches and Revelations', leads us to the main body of the work, a photographic reproduction of the *Sketchbook* itself; but 'Sketches and Revelations' will itself repay careful scrutiny: it affords glimpses into the mind of an artist, hinting at where he got his ideas and what he did with them. Above all, this reviewer appreciated the way in which this chapter underscored the *organic* nature of art, and of ideas, how they came to be pencil sketches on paper – and where they went from there.

As noted earlier, Morgan's sketches, embracing nearly eighty pages, form the heart of Lee's work; they would have been well worth publishing, just as they were, without additional material. But that additional material is crucial: it fleshes things out, makes major

contributions to an understanding of Morgan's *Sketchbook* itself. Similarly, three appendices conclude things in a satisfying way – among them, a catalogue of all of the artist's numismatic works created during his nearly fifty years at the United States Mint. Morgan's productions ran the gamut, from a series of pattern half dollars created within a few months of his arrival in America; to the silver dollar that still bears his name, minted from 1878 to 1904 and again in 1921; to some medals he created at the United States Mint and others struck privately; to a remarkable, sensitive portrait of a young Abraham Lincoln, gracing a commemorative coin struck in 1918, by which time Morgan was finally out from under the thumb of the Barbers and had become Chief Engraver in his own right. All in all, it was a remarkable output. But then, George T. Morgan was a remarkable man, and this is a remarkable book.

RICHARD G. DOTY†

Royal Commemorative Medals 1837–1977. Volume 8. Queen Elizabeth II: Coronation 1953 – Silver Jubilee 1977, by Andrew Whittlestone and Michael Ewing (Llanfyllin: Galata Print 2012), 108 pp.

THIS concluding volume in Whittlestone and Ewing's series on royal commemorative medals details the period from the accession of Queen Elizabeth II after the death of her father King George VI in 1952. It covers the years of medal production between her coronation in 1953 to her Silver Jubilee in 1977, this being the most recent period of the production of royal medals in significant numbers.

The volume begins with a preface from the authors stating that the format of this volume continues in the same style as the rest of the series. It states what type of object is included and what is not, and explains the format of the catalogue. The medals are once again presented chronologically, then alphabetically and some indication is given as to the rarity and value of each medal listed. The dimensions and materials of each medal are also given in each catalogue entry. So, the format of this volume continues in the same vein as its predecessors and, a few curiously inaccurate institution names in the credits aside, it is laid out in a very comprehensive style, each medal being illustrated with a photograph where possible.

Something of an unusual feature of this volume is the unique beginning of the production of medals for Elizabeth II's reign in that the Royal Mint did not produce any official coronation medals. This fact is hugely significant as coronation medals have been produced by the Mint for every monarch from James I onwards. The exact reason for this change and the curtailing of a long-lasting royal practice is not explained. Instead, this volume begins with some images of obverse medal designs featuring Elizabeth II's portrait which were made just in case of any future demand from the trade. It must be said that these images are not terribly well presented.

Another slight disappointment is the use of black and white images of each medal in the catalogue. These are significant objects that could have been brought to

life with at least some colour photographs. Instead, the medals appear flat, dull and lifeless as they are in some cases poorly lit which makes it difficult to see their detail and read their inscriptions properly. Presumably this is a cost-saving exercise, which is of course perfectly understandable, but it is still a shame that the medals themselves cannot be shown to their best effect. It is also something of a pity that several obverse and reverse images overlap each other, giving some pages in the volume a cluttered or untidy appearance.

The medals included are, as in preceding volumes in the series, commemorative of significant royal events and visits during the period covered by the catalogue. The bulk of the catalogue itself is dominated by the opening and concluding sections – medals to commemorate the coronation and the Silver Jubilee. The rest of the catalogue focuses on other royal events such as the Commonwealth Tour of 1953 to 1954 and visits to various countries, the Investiture of the Prince of Wales, the royal silver wedding anniversary and, in something of a neat throwback to the first volume in this

catalogue series, a medal commemorating the 150th anniversary of the birth of Queen Victoria. Some of the more unusual inclusions are a medal celebrating the opening of the Birmingham inner ring road by the Queen in 1971 and a medal commemorating the opening of the National Motor Museum by the Duke of Kent in 1972.

In short, this is a satisfying volume that not only signals the conclusion of this range of catalogues but also heralds a change in the production of royal commemorative medals. The introduction states that a relatively small number of medals were produced for the Golden and Diamond Jubilees and suggests that this could be explained by the decline in collectability of royal medals since 1977. Medals produced during that period do not appear to have increased in value over time and this has had the unfortunate effect of threatening the death of the tradition. In more ways than one, *Royal Commemorative Medals* Volume 8 may represent the end of an era.

HENRY FLYNN